



**MINUTES No. 20**  
**of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts**

*The session has been held in remote mode using electronic video-conferencing*

***December 20, 2025***

*Start of session: 5:15 p.m.*

*End of session: 5:35 p.m.*

**Those present at the session of the members of the Advisory Group of Experts:**

*Oksana Vasylychenko, Aleš Zalar, Vasyl Shakun, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk, Hanna Suchocka.*

**Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:**

*Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Thomas Griffith, Vitalii Makhinchuk, Marek Zubik, Richard Barrett.*

**Suggested agenda:**

**1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.**

- Deciding on the compliance of Zavalniuk Ihor, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Zatolochnyi Vitalii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Klymenko Oleksii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Lenher Yana, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Mostetska Anna, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Nykon Olesia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

- Deciding on the compliance of Prydatko Vitalii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Saliuk Petro, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- Deciding on the compliance of Tkachenko Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

**Decided:** the suggested agenda is approved.

**Consideration of agenda items:**

**1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of all candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities**



**1.1. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Zavalniuk Ihor, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Zavalniuk Ihor, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “AGAINST”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 5 votes, “AGAINST” – 1 vote.

**Decided:** that Zavalniuk Ihor, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**1.2. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Zatolochnyi Vitalii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Zatolochnyi Vitalii, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

**Decided:** that Zatolochnyi Vitalii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**1.3. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Klymenko Oleksii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Klymenko Oleksii, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

**Decided:** that Klymenko Oleksii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**1.4. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Lenher Yana, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Maureen O'Connor who informed that under the self-recusal application made by the member of the Advisory Group of Experts Oksana Vasylchenko regarding the assessment of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Lenher Yana, granted by the Advisory Group on September 15, 2025 (Minutes No. 18), deputy member of the Advisory Group of Experts Vitalii Makhinchuk will participate in the decision-making regarding the eligibility of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Lenher Yana by the criterion of high moral qualities, who, under part 4, Art. 1012 of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", exercises the authorities of the member of the Advisory Group of Experts regarding consideration of issues and voting in the decision-making process of the Advisory Group of Experts.

Maureen O'Connor, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Lenher Yana, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Vitalii Makhinchuk: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

**Decided:** that Lenher Yana, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар

Василь Шакун



(Aleš Zalar)

(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Віталій Махінчук  
(Vitalii Makhinchuk)

Морін О'Коннор  
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

**1.5. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Mostetska Anna, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Mostetska Anna, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "AGAINST"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 5 votes, "AGAINST" – 1 vote.

**Decided:** that Mostetska Anna, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**



Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор  
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

**1.6. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Nykon Olesia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of an assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Nykon Olesia, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “AGAINST”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “AGAINST”
- Maureen O'Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “AGAINST”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 3 votes, “AGAINST” – 3 votes.

**Decided:** in accordance with paragraph twenty of Section IV (subparagraph two) of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, no decision was reached.

**Heard:**





Oksana Vasylchenko, who said that, according to the paragraph twenty of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, during the transitional selection period, the Advisory Group of Experts shall take decisions by at least four votes from its members, of which at least two are nominated by international organisations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law.

The candidate received four votes in favor, but only one of them was cast by a member proposed by international organisations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law. If, due to an equal number of votes in favor and against, the Advisory Group of Experts is unable to reach a decision, a repeated vote shall be held

Oksana Vasylchenko said that given these provisions of the law, as well as the equal number of votes in favor and against the candidate Nykon Olesia, the Advisory Group of Experts should hold a repeated vote.

**Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Nykon Olesia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities through a repeated vote**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of an assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Nykon Olesia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Oksana Vasylchenko also informed that in accordance with paragraph twenty of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine,” if there is an equal number of votes in favor and against after the repeated vote, the votes of three members of the Advisory Group of Experts, of whom at least two are nominated by international organisations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law, shall be decisive.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “AGAINST”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “ AGAINST”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “ AGAINST”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 3 votes, “AGAINST” – 3 votes

**Decided:** that, guided by paragraph twenty of Section IV (subparagraph three) of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, Nykon Olesia, candidate for the position of a



judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор  
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

**1.7. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Prydatko Vitalii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Prydatko Vitalii, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

**Decided:** that Prydatko Vitalii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the



competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор  
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

**1.8. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Saliuk Petro, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of an assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Saliuk Petro, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes



**Decided:** that Saliuk Petro, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор  
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

**1.9. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Tkachenko Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following discussions with members of the Advisory Group of Experts and based on the results of an assessment of the high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Tkachenko Oleksandr, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.



**Decided:** that Tkachenko Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор  
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

Oksana Vasylchenko noted that all issues from the agenda were considered.

**Chair of  
the Advisory Group of Experts**

**Oksana Vasylchenko**

**Video recording of the live meeting broadcast:**



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

