



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**MINUTES No. 15
of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts**

The session has been held in remote mode using electronic video-conferencing

January 28, 2025

Start of the meeting: 18:00

End of the meeting: 18:51

Those present at the session of the members of the Advisory Group of Experts:

*Oksana Vasylychenko, Aleš Zalar, Vasyl Shakun, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk,
Hanna Suchocka.*

Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:

Richard Barrett, Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Thomas Griffith, Vitaly Makhinchuk.

Suggested agenda:

1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.

- 1.1. Deciding on the compliance of Olga Balatska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.2. Deciding on the compliance of Yurii Barabash, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.3. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Vodiannikov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.4. Deciding on the compliance of Roman Holobutovskyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.5. Deciding on the compliance of Mykola Hrabar, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

- 1.6. Deciding on the compliance of Nataliia Denysenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.7. Deciding on the compliance of Denys Hrytsenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.8. Deciding on the compliance of Serhii Dovhal, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.9. Deciding on the compliance of Anatolii Yezhov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.10. Deciding on the compliance of Vladyslav Ivashchenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.11. Deciding on the compliance of Nataliia Kaminska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.12. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Konstany, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.13. Deciding on the compliance of Konstantin Krasovsky, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.14. Deciding on the compliance of Yulia Kyrychenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.15. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Klymenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.16. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Kopylenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.17. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Medvedenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.18. Deciding on the compliance of Anatolii Melnychuk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.19. Deciding on the compliance of Ruslan Milovanov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

- 1.20. Deciding on the compliance of Olha Morozova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.21. Deciding on the compliance of Ivan Nazarov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.22. Deciding on the compliance of Tetiana Opanasiuk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.23. Deciding on the compliance of Svitlana Reznikova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.24. Deciding on the compliance of Artem Rubanets, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.25. Deciding on the compliance of Mykhailo Savchyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.26. Deciding on the compliance of Alla Sanduliak, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.27. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Soldatenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.28. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Tkachenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.29. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Tretyakova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.30. Deciding on the compliance of Zakhar Tropin, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.31. Deciding on the compliance of Olena Fitsai, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.32. Deciding on the compliance of Taras Tsymbalistyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.33. Deciding on the compliance of Roman Yaromenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.34. Deciding on the compliance of Ihor Yarchak, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

2. On the announcement of the date of written assessment of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: to approve the suggested agenda.

Consideration of agenda items:

1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Maureen O'Connor reported that in the period from 14 January 2025 to 21 January 2025, the Advisory Group of Experts, in assessing the compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities, interviewed candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine within the framework of competitions announced by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine and the President of Ukraine. The purpose of these interviews was, in particular, to refute any doubts about the high moral qualities of such candidates.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.1. Deciding on the compliance of Olga Balatska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Olha Balatska, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Olha Balatska, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шагун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.2. Deciding on the compliance of Yurii Barabash, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Yurii Hryhorovych Barabash, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Yurii Barabash, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.3. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Vodiannikov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksandr Vodiannikov as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oleksandr Vodiannikov, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.4. Deciding on the compliance of Roman Holobutovskyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Roman Golobutovsky, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Roman Holobutovskyi, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.5. Deciding on the compliance of Mykola Hrabar, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykola Hrabar as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykola Hrabar does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.6. Deciding on the compliance of Nataliia Denysenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylichenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise Nataliia Denysenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylichenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "AGAINST"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "AGAINST"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 4 votes, "AGAINST" - 2 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Nataliia Denysenko complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylichenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.7. Deciding on the compliance of Denys Hrytsenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Denys Hrytsenko as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Denys Hrytsenko does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шагун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.8. Deciding on the compliance of Serhii Dovhal, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Dovhal as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Serhii Dovhal, does not comply the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.9. Deciding on the compliance of Anatolii Yezhov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Anatolii Yezhov, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Anatolii Yezhov, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.10. Deciding on the compliance of Vladyslav Ivashchenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Vladyslav Ivashchenko as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Vladyslav Ivashchenko complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.11. Deciding on the compliance of Nataliia Kaminska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Natalia Kaminska as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Nataliia Kaminska does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.12. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Konstany, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksandr Konstany as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oleksandr Kostiantyn, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.13. Deciding on the compliance of Konstantin Krasovsky, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Konstantin Krasovsky, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "AGAINST"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "AGAINST"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "AGAINST"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 3 votes, "AGAINST" - 3 votes.

Decided: in accordance with the second paragraph of Section IV, paragraph 20 of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", the decision was not adopted.

Heard

Oksana Vasylychenko, who informed that, according to paragraph 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", during the transitional period of selection, the Advisory Group of Experts shall make decisions by at least four votes of its members, of which at least two are proposed by international organisations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law.

If the Advisory Group is unable to reach a decision due to an equal number of votes in favour and against, a second vote shall be taken.

Oksana Vasylychenko informed that, given the relevant provisions of the law and the equal number of votes "FOR" and "AGAINST" regarding the candidate Konstantin Krasovsky, the Advisory Group of Experts should hold a second vote.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Reconsideration of the issue of compliance of the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Kostiantyn Krasovskyi with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, re-proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Kostiantyn Krasovskyi, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Oksana Vasylchenko also informed that, in accordance with paragraph 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", in case of an equal number of votes for and against during the second vote, the votes of three members of the Advisory Group of Experts, of whom at least two are nominated by international organisations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law, are decisive.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "AGAINST"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "AGAINST"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "AGAINST"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 3 votes, "AGAINST" - 3 votes.

Decided: guided by the third paragraph of Section IV, paragraph 20 of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", that the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Kostiantyn Krasovskyi, for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.14. Deciding on the compliance of Yulia Kyrychenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Yulia Mykolaivna Kyrychenko, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "AGAINST"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "AGAINST"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 4 votes, "AGAINST" - 2 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Yulia Kyrychenko, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.15. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Klymenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Klymenko as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Klymenko complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.16. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Kopylenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oleksandr Kopylenko, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oleksandr Kopylenko, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.17. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Medvedenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oleksandr Medvedenko, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oleksandr Medvedenko, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.18. Deciding on the compliance of Anatolii Melnychuk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Anatolii Melnychuk, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Anatolii Melnychuk, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.19. Deciding on the compliance of Ruslan Milovanov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Milovanov, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Ruslan Milovanov does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.20. Deciding on the compliance of Olha Morozova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Olha Morozova, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Olha Morozova, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.21. Deciding on the compliance of Ivan Nazarov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Ivan Nazarov as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Ivan Volodymyrov complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.22. Deciding on the compliance of Tetiana Opanasiuk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Tetiana Opanasiuk, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Tetiana Opanasiuk, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.23. Deciding on the compliance of Svitlana Reznikova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise Svitlana Reznikova, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: Svitlana Reznikova, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.24. Deciding on the compliance of Artem Rubanets, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Artem Rubanets as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Artem Rubanets, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.25. Deciding on the compliance of Mykhailo Savchyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Mykhailo Savchyn, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Mykhailo Savchyn, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.26. Deciding on the compliance of Alla Sanduliak, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise Alla Sanduliak, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Alla Sanduliak, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.27. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Soldatenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oksana Soldatenko, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oksana Soldatenko, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.28. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Tkachenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksandr Tkachenko as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksandr Tkachenko does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.29. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Tretyakova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Tretyakova as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Oksana Tretyakova, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.30. Deciding on the compliance of Zakhar Tropin, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Maureen O'Connor, who, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Zakhar Tropin, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Vitaly Makhinchuk: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Zakhar Tropin, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шагун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Віталій Махінчук
(Vitaly Makhinchuk)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.31. Deciding on the compliance of Olena Fitsai, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise Olena Fitsai, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olena Fitsai does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.32. Deciding on the compliance of Taras Tsymbalystyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Taras Tsymbalystyi as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Taras Tsymbalystyi complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.33. Deciding on the compliance of Roman Yaromenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Roman Yaromenko, as such that comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Roman Yaromenok, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.34. Deciding on the compliance of Ihor Yarchak, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognise the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Ihor Stepanovych Yarchak as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Vote:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Ales Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR".
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" - 6 votes, "AGAINST" - 0 votes.

Decided: the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, Ihor Yarchak, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities for the purposes of selecting candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine on a competitive basis.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шаkun
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

2. On the announcement of the date of written assessment of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko who informed that AGE members have preliminarily agreed on the date for conducting a written evaluation of candidates of the position of judges of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, which is set for February 08, 2025.

Oksana Vasylchenko noted that all issues from the agenda were considered.

**Chairman of the Advisory Group of
Experts**

Oksana Vasylchenko

Video recording of the meeting broadcast:

