



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**MINUTES No. 11  
of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts**

*The session has been held in remote mode using electronic video-conferencing*

***July 31, 2024***

*Start of session: 5:00 p.m.*

*End of session: 5:22 p.m.*

**Those present at the session of the members of the Advisory Group of Experts:**

*Oksana Vasylenko, Aleš Zalar, Vasyl Shakun, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk, Hanna Suchocka.*

**Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:**

*Richard Barrett, Marek Zubik, Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Thomas Griffith.*

**Suggested agenda:**

1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of all candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities
  - 1.1. Deciding on the compliance of Kaminska Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
  - 1.2. Deciding on the compliance of Krasovskyi Kostiantyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
  - 1.3. Deciding on the compliance of Novikova Tamara, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
  - 1.4. Deciding on the compliance of Radutnyi Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
  - 1.5. Deciding on the compliance of Romanenko Liudmyla, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.
  - 1.6. Deciding on the compliance of Rubanets Artem, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities.



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

2. On informing the President of Ukraine about the results of the assessment of compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

**Decided:** the suggested agenda is approved.

**Consideration of agenda items:**

**1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of all candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar who informed that in the time span from July 15 to July 16, 2024 the Advisory Group of Experts, while assessing the compliance of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities, conducted interviews with candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine from the President of Ukraine, aiming to refute any doubts regarding high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**1.1 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Kaminska Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Kaminska Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

**Decided:** that Kaminska Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**1.2 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Krasovskiy Kostiantyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Krasovskiy Kostiantyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

**Decided:** that Krasovskiy Kostiantyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**1.3 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Novikova Tamara, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Novikova Tamara, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

**Decided:** that Novikova Tamara, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**1.4 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Radutnyi Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Radutnyi Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

**Decided:** that Radutnyi Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**1.5 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Romanenko Liudmyla, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Romanenko Liudmyla, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

**Decided:** that Romanenko Liudmyla, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**1.6 Adopting a decision related to the assessment of Rubanets Artem, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of high moral qualities**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of evaluation of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Rubanets Artem, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

**Voted:**

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

**Decided:** that Rubanets Artem, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

**Signatures:**

Алеш Залар  
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун  
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька  
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко  
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор  
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк  
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)





**ДОРАДЧА  
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**2. On informing the President of Ukraine about the results of the assessment of compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities.**

**Heard:**

Aleš Zalar who informed that the AGE will immediately inform the President of Ukraine about the results of assessment of high moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Aleš Zalar noted that all issues from the agenda were considered.

**Chairman of  
the Advisory Group of Experts**

**Aleš Zalar**

**Video recording of the live meeting broadcast:**

