



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

**MINUTES No. 16
of the meeting of the Advisory Group of Experts**

Lviv, Ukraine

February 18, 2025

Start of session: 09:30 a.m.

End of session: 10:15 p.m.

Those present at the session of the members of the Advisory Group of Experts:

Oksana Vasylychenko, Aleš Zalar, Vasyl Shakun, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk, Hanna Suchocka.

Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:

Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Marec Zubik, Vitaly Makhinchuk (in person) and Richard Barrett, Thomas Griffith (in remote mode using electronic video-conferencing).

Suggested agenda:

1. On conducting additional interviews for assessing the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.
2. On the assessment of compliance of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 2.1. Deciding on the compliance of Yurii Barabash, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 2.2. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Vodiannikov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 2.3. Deciding on the compliance of Nataliia Denysenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 2.4. Deciding on the compliance of Vladyslav Ivashchenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

- 2.5. Deciding on the compliance of Anatolii Yezhov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.6. Deciding on the compliance of Yulia Kyrychenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.7. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Klymenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.8. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Konstany, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.9. Deciding on the compliance of Konstantin Krasovsky, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.10. Deciding on the compliance of Oleksandr Medvedenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.11. Deciding on the compliance of Ivan Nazarov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.12. Deciding on the compliance of Tetiana Opanasiuk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.13. Deciding on the compliance of Mykhailo Savchyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.14. Deciding on the compliance of Alla Sanduliak, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.15. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Soldatenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
- 2.16. Deciding on the compliance of Oksana Tretyakova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.17. Deciding on the compliance of Zakhar Tropin, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

2.18. Deciding on the compliance of Taras Tsymbalistyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

2.19. Deciding on the compliance of Roman Yaromenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

3. On ranking voting for candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine and formation of their ranking list.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

Decided: the suggested agenda is approved.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

Consideration of agenda items:

1. On conducting additional interviews for assessing the level of the competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who pointed out that on February 08, 2025, the Advisory Group of Experts conducted a written assignment of the candidates as part of the stage of assessing their level of competence in the field of law and, then, in accordance with the AGE Methodology, within 15 days after the completion of the written assignment of all candidates, the Advisory Group should decide on the need for additional interviews.

Oksana Vasylychenko, who informed that, having reviewed the written responses of the candidates, as well as taking into account the information accumulated by the Advisory Group, including the professional experience of the candidates, the Advisory Group has sufficient information to continue assessing the level of competence of the candidates without conducting additional interviews.

Oksana Vasylychenko who proposed not to conduct additional interviews for assessing the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

Decided: not to conduct additional interviews for assessing the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

2. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of all candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.1. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Yurii Barabash, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Yurii Barabash, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Yurii Barabash, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.2. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oleksandr Vodiannikov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oleksandr Vodiannikov, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Oleksandr Vodiannikov, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.3. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Denysenko Nataliia, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Denysenko Nataliia, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.4. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Vladyslav Ivashchenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Vladyslav Ivashchenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Vladyslav Ivashchenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.5. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Anatolii Yezhov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Anatolii Yezhov, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Anatolii Yezhov, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.6. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Yulia Kyrychenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Yulia Kyrychenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Yulia Kyrychenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.7. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oksana Klymenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oksana Klymenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Oksana Klymenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.8. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oleksandr Konstany, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oleksandr Konstany, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Oleksandr Konstany, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.9. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Konstantin Krasovsky, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Konstantin Krasovsky, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Konstantin Krasovsky, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.10. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oleksandr Medvedenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oleksandr Medvedenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Oleksandr Medvedenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.11. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Ivan Nazarov, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Ivan Nazarov, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Ivan Nazarov, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.12. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Tetiana Opanasiuk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Tetiana Opanasiuk, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Tetiana Opanasiuk, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.13. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Mykhailo Savchyn, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Mykhailo Savchyn, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Mykhailo Savchyn, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.14. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Alla Sanduliak, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Alla Sanduliak, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Alla Sanduliak, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.15. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oksana Soldatenko, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oksana Soldatenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Oksana Soldatenko, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.16. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oksana Tretyakova, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oksana Tretyakova, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Oksana Tretyakova, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.17. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Zakhar Tropin, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Maureen O'Connor, who informed that under the self-recusal application made by the member of the Advisory Group Oksana Vasylychenko regarding evaluation of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Zakhar Tropin, granted by the Advisory Group on November 07, 2024 (Minutes No. 12), deputy member of the Advisory Group Vitaly Makhinchuk will participate in the ranking voting regarding the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Zakhar Tropin, who, under part 4. Art. 10-12 of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", exercises the authorities of the member of the Advisory Group regarding consideration of issues and voting in the decision-making process of the Advisory Group.

Maureen O'Connor, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Zakhar Tropin, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Vitaly Makhinchuk: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Zakhar Tropin, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Віталій Махінчук
(Vitaly Makhinchuk)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.18. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Taras Tsymbalistyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Taras Tsymbalistyi, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Taras Tsymbalistyi, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

2.19. Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Roman Yaromenok, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Roman Yaromenok, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
 - Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
 - Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
 - Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
 - Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
 - Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"
- Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes

Decided: that Roman Yaromenok, a candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Oksana Vasylychenko announced the general list of all assessed candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in alphabetical order, admitted to the competitive selection by the Committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy, namely:

1. Barabash Yurii.
2. Vodiannikov Oleksandr.
3. Kyrychenko Yulia.
4. Klymenko Oksana.
5. Tropin Zakhar.
6. Tsymbalistyi Taras.

Oksana Vasylychenko also proposed to form a general list of all assessed candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in alphabetical order, admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine, namely:

1. Barabash Yurii.
2. Vodiannikov Oleksandr
3. Kostianty Oleksandr.
4. Savchyn Mykhailo.
5. Soldatenko Oksana.
6. Yaromenok Roman.

3. On ranking voting for candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine and formation of their ranking list

Regarding the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, admitted by the Committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy

3.1. Ranking voting for Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: gave the vote “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: gave the vote “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: gave the vote “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Barabash Yurii received 6 votes “FOR”.

3.2. Ranking voting for Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: gave the vote “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: gave the vote “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Vodiannikov Oleksandr received 4 votes “FOR”.

3.3. Ranking voting for Kyrychenko Yulia, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Kyrychenko Yulia, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: gave the vote “FOR”



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

- Maureen O'Connor: gave the vote "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote "FOR"

The candidate Kyrychenko Yulia received 3 votes "FOR".

3.4. Ranking voting for Klymenko Oksana, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Klymenko Oksana, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: gave the vote "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: gave the vote "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: gave the vote "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote "FOR"

The candidate Klymenko Oksana received 4 votes "FOR".

3.5. Ranking voting for Tropin Zakhar, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Maureen O'Connor, who informed that under the self-recusal application made by the member of the Advisory Group Oksana Vasylychenko regarding evaluation of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Zakhar Tropin, granted by the Advisory Group on November 07, 2024 (Minutes No. 12), deputy member of the Advisory Group Vitaly Makhinchuk will participate in the ranking voting regarding the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Zakhar Tropin, who, under part 4. Art. 10-12 of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", exercises the authorities of the member of the Advisory Group regarding consideration of issues and voting in the decision-making process of the Advisory Group.

Maureen O'Connor proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Tropin Zakhar, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy.

Voted:



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

- Vitaly Makhinchuk: gave the vote “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: gave the vote “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Tropin Zakhar received 5 votes “FOR”.

3.6. Ranking voting for Tsymbalistyi Taras, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Tsymbalistyi Taras, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: gave the vote “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Tsymbalistyi Taras received 3 votes “FOR”.

Regarding the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, whom the Selection Commission has admitted for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine

3.7. Ranking voting for Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: gave the vote "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: gave the vote "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: gave the vote "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: gave the vote "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: gave the vote "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote "FOR"

The candidate Barabash Yurii received 6 votes "FOR".

3.8. Ranking voting for Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: gave the vote "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: gave the vote "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: gave the vote "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote "FOR"

The candidate Vodiannikov Oleksandr received 4 votes "FOR".

3.9. Ranking voting for Kostianty Oleksandr, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Kostianty Oleksandr, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: gave the vote "FOR"



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

- Vasyl Shakun: gave the vote “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Kostianty Oleksandr received 5 votes “FOR”.

3.10. Ranking voting for Savchyn Mykhailo, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Savchyn Mykhailo, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: gave the vote “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: gave the vote “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Savchyn Mykhailo received 4 votes “FOR”.

3.11. Ranking voting for Soldatenko Oksana, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Soldatenko Oksana, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Maureen O’Connor: gave the vote “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote “FOR”

The candidate Soldatenko Oksana received 2 votes “FOR”.



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

3.12. Ranking voting for Yaromenok Roman, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko proposed to the members of the Advisory Group to determine, through a rating vote, their position regarding Yaromenok Roman, candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, who has been admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Hanna Suchocka: gave the vote "FOR"

The candidate Yaromenok Roman received 1 vote "FOR."

Regarding the formation of a ranking list of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who announced the rating list of assessed candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine formed as a result of the Advisory Group's voting, namely:

Rating list of candidates admitted to the competitive selection by the Committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy:

1. Barabash Yurii– 6 votes "FOR".
2. Tropin Zakhar – 5 votes "FOR".
3. Vodiannikov Oleksandr – 4 votes "FOR".
3. Klymenko Oksana – 4 votes "FOR".
4. Kyrychenko Yulia – 3 votes "FOR".
4. Tsymbalystyi Taras – 3 votes "FOR".



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

Rating list of candidates admitted to the competitive selection by the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine:

1. Barabash Yurii – 6 votes “FOR”.
2. Kostianty Oleksandr – 5 votes “FOR”.
3. Vodiannikov Oleksandr – 4 votes “FOR”.
3. Savchyn Mykhailo – 4 votes “FOR”.
4. Soldatenko Oksana – 2 votes “FOR”.
5. Yaromenok Roman – 1 vote “FOR”.

Oksana Vasylychenko informed that the Advisory Group has completed all the stages of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine as provided for by the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine” and urgently needs to submit of the rating lists and reasoned decisions regarding the assessed candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine to the Committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Legal Policy and the Selection Commission for the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in respect of persons appointed by the President of Ukraine.

Oksana Vasylychenko noted that all issues from the agenda were considered since no objections or clarifications were raised.

**Chair of the Advisory Group of
Experts**

Oksana Vasylychenko



**ADVISORY GROUP
OF EXPERTS**

Video recording of the live meeting broadcast:

