



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**MINUTES No. 7
of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts**

The session has been held in remote mode using electronic video-conferencing

May 02, 2024

Start of session: 5:10 p.m.

End of session: 5:40 p.m.

Those present at the session of the members of the Advisory Group of Experts:

Oksana Vasylchenko, Aleš Zalar, Nataliia Kuznietsova, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk, Hanna Suchocka.

Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:

Richard Barrett, Marec Zubik, Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Vasyl Shakun.

Suggested agenda:

1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.1. Deciding on the compliance of Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.2. Deciding on the compliance of Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.3. Deciding on the compliance of Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.4. Deciding on the compliance of Alla Oliinyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.5. Deciding on the compliance of Riznyk Serhii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.6. Deciding on the compliance of Tsymbalistyi Taras, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.
 - 1.7. Deciding on the compliance of Yanovska Oleksandra, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

1.8. Deciding on the compliance of Yaromenok Roman, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: the suggested agenda is approved.

Consideration of agenda items:

1. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of all candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar who informed the Advisory Group has completed the assessment of the compliance of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of recognized level of competence in the field of law by collecting and analyzing all necessary information for a comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine in the field of law, and by conducting written assignment of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine from the Congress of Judges of Ukraine and the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine.

Besides that, Aleš Zalar drew attention to the fact that in accordance with subparagraph 3 of part thirty, Article 10(2) of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, the members of the Advisory Group who have declared their self-recusal regarding the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine shall not participate in the voting on the respective candidates.

1.1 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar who informed that under the self-recusal application made by the member of the Advisory Group of Experts Nataliia Kuznietsova regarding the assessment of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Barabash Yurii, granted by the Advisory Group on January 11, 2024 (Minutes No. 3), deputy member of the Advisory Group of Experts Vasyl Shakun will participate in the decision-making regarding the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Barabash Yurii with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

law, who, under part 4, Art. 10¹² of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, exercises the authorities of the member of the Advisory Group of Experts regarding consideration of issues and voting in the decision-making process of the Advisory Group of Experts.

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: that Barabash Yurii, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.2 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: that Vodiannikov Oleksandr, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнєцова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.3 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
 - Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
 - Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
 - Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”
- Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: that Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнєцова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.4 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Alla Oliinyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Heard:

Aleš Zalar who informed that under the self-recusal application made by the member of the Advisory Group of Experts Yaroslav Romaniuk regarding evaluation of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Alla Oliinyk, granted by the Advisory Group on January 11, 2024 (Minutes No. 3), deputy member of the Advisory Group of Experts Volodymyr Kuzmenko will participate in the decision-making regarding the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Alla Oliinyk with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law, who, under part 4. Art. 10¹² of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, exercises the authorities of the member of the Advisory Group of Experts regarding consideration of issues and voting in the decision-making process of the Advisory Group of Experts.

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Alla Oliinyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Volodymyr Kuzmenko: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: that Alla Oliinyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнецова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Володимир Кузьменко
(Volodymyr Kuzmenko)

1.5 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Serhii Riznyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Serhii Riznyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: that Serhii Riznyk, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнєцова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.6 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Taras Tsymbalistyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Taras Tsymbalistyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: that Taras Tsymbalistyi, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнецова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.7 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Oleksandra Yanovska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Oleksandra Yanovska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: “FOR”
- Maureen O'Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: that Oleksandra Yanovska, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнєцова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.8 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Yaromenok Roman, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Aleš Zalar, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Roman Yaromenok, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Nataliia Kuznietsova: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

Total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

Decided: that Roman Yaromenok, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Наталія Кузнєцова
(Nataliia Kuznietsova)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

Aleš Zalar noted that all issues from the agenda were considered.

**Chairman of the Advisory Group of
Experts**

Aleš Zalar

Video recording of the live meeting broadcast:

