

**APPROVED** 

Minutes No. 15 of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts of January 28, 2025

## **DECISION No. 1.27**

On the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Soldatenko with the criterion of high moral qualities

The Advisory Group of Experts (hereinafter referred to as the Advisory Group) in remote mode using electronic video-conference means, consisting of the Chair of the Advisory Group Oksana Vasylchenko, Secretary of the Advisory Group Maureen O'Connor, members of the Advisory Group: Aleš Zalar, Yaroslav Romaniuk, Vasyl Shakun, Hanna Suchocka, in the presence of deputy members of the Advisory Group: Vitalii Makhinchuk, Thomas Griffith, Richard Barrett, Volodymyr Kuzmenko, having assessed the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Soldatenko (hereinafter referred to as the "Candidate") with the criterion of high moral qualities, under the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine" (hereinafter referred to as the "Law"), the Regulations of the Advisory Group of Experts, approved by the decision of the Advisory Group of Experts of November 12, 2023, with

amendments approved by Minutes No. 10 of the meeting of the Advisory Group of Experts dated May 30, 2024 (hereinafter referred to as the "Regulations"), the Methodology for Assessing Moral Qualities and Competency in the Field of Law of the Candidates for the Position of Judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, approved by the decision of the Advisory Group of Experts on December 4, 2023, with amendments approved by Minutes No. 10 of the meeting of the Advisory Group of Experts dated May 30, 2024 (hereinafter referred to as the "Methodology"),

## established the following

- 1. Under part 25, Article 10<sup>2</sup> of the Law, the Advisory Group, among other things, assesses the moral qualities of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.
- 2. Under Article 10<sup>8</sup> of the Law, the Advisory Group, within four months from the date of receipt of all documents submitted by the candidates from the Selection Commission for the Competitive Selection of Candidates for the Position of Judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine regarding the persons appointed by the President of Ukraine, the Committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine in charge of issues pertaining to the legal status of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, and the Council of Judges of Ukraine, should review and study the submitted documents, the results of the special check, other information and materials received by the Advisory Group while exercising its powers, and after interviewing the candidate, having assessed high moral qualities of the candidate, should make a reasoned decision on the assessment of compliance with the criterion of moral qualities.
- 3. The criterion "high moral qualities", envisaged by Article 10<sup>8</sup> of the Law, is determined by the Advisory Group in the course of assessment of the "integrity" component through the indicators of independence, honesty, impartiality, diligence, incorruptibility, compliance with ethical standards and demonstration of impeccable behaviour in professional activities and personal life, as well as through the component of

"the legality of sources of property origin", "compliance of the standard of living of the candidate or his/her family members with the declared income", "compliance of the candidate's lifestyle with his/her status", the content of which is outlined in part 1, Article 2 of the Methodology.

- 4. Under paragraph 1, part 3, Article 10<sup>8</sup> of the Law, a candidate may be considered compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities only if he/she is of good integrity and there are no reasonable doubts as to the legality of the sources of his/her property, the compliance of the standard of living of the candidate or his/her family members with the declared income, and the compliance of the candidate's lifestyle with his/her status. Under paragraph 4, part 3, Article 10<sup>8</sup> of the Law, a candidate fails to meet this criterion if it is proved that s/he/she does not comply with it or there are reasonable doubts about his/her compliance.
- 5. On October 18, 2024, the Advisory Group received from the Competition Commission the documents of Soldatenko Oksana Volodymyrivna, Professor of the Department of Law at Poltava University of Economics and Trade, for participation in the competitive selection for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with respect to candidates appointed by the President of Ukraine (letter No.  $\Delta\Gamma$ E -913/24-in dated October 18, 2024).
- 6. The Advisory Group conducted a review, verification, and analysis of the Candidate's documents, her written explanations, information obtained from state authorities, public organizations, state registers, databases, private legal entities, as well as data received from the National Agency on Corruption Prevention and the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine.
- 7. On January 21, 2025, the Advisory Group <u>interviewed</u> the Candidate, in particular to refute doubts about the Candidate's compliance with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 8. The Advisory Group completed the review, verification, and analysis of the Candidate's documents, both individually and collectively, as well as the Candidate's responses to the Advisory Group's written questions and questions posed during the

interview, and resolved that the Candidate meets the criterion of high moral qualities, based on the following.

- 9. As of the date of the interview, the Advisory Group had certain doubts regarding the Candidate's compliance with the criterion of high moral qualities, specifically her adherence to the indicators of the "integrity" component, such as "honesty" and "diligence," as well as the components of "legitimacy of the sources of property origin" and "compliance of the Candidate's or their family members' standard of living with declared income", "compliance of the Candidate's lifestyle with their status". At the same time, these doubts were refuted based on the analysis of the Candidate's documents, both individually and in their entirety, as well as the Candidate's responses to the Advisory Group's written questions and those provided during the interview, along with the information obtained by the Advisory Group during the Candidate's evaluation.
- 10. Thus, based on the assessment of the Candidate's moral qualities, the Advisory Group did not find her to be non-compliant with the indicators of the "integrity" component of the criterion of high moral qualities (point "a" of Part 1 of Article 2 of the Methodology). Moreover, in accordance with Part 3 of Article 2 of the Methodology, the Advisory Group has no substantiated doubts regarding the Candidate's compliance with any indicator of the "integrity" component (point "a" of Part 1 of Article 2 of the Methodology).
- 11. The Advisory Group also found no evidence of non-compliance and has no substantiated doubts regarding the Candidate's compliance with the components of "legitimacy of the sources of property origin," "compliance of the Candidate's or their family members' standard of living with declared income," and "compliance of the Candidate's lifestyle with their status" in relation to the criterion of high moral qualities (point "b" of Part 1 of Article 2 of the Methodology).

Thus, being guided by Articles 6 and 7 of the Regulations of the Advisory Group of Experts, approved by the decision of the Advisory Group of Experts of November 12, 2023, with changes approved by Minutes No. 10 of the meeting of the Advisory Group of Experts

of May 30, 2024, the Methodology for Assessing Moral Qualities and Competency in the Field of Law of the Candidates for the Position of Judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, approved by the decision of the Advisory Group of Experts of December 4, 2023, with amendments approved by Minutes No. 10 of the meeting of the Advisory Group of Experts of May 30, 2024, and Articles 10<sup>2</sup>, 10<sup>8</sup> of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", the Advisory Group of Experts

## has decided that

for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, the candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Soldatenko complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

## **Signatures:**

Алеш Залар Василь Шакун

(Aleš Zalar) (Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька Оксана Васильченко

(Hanna Suchocka) (Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор Ярослав Романюк

(Maureen O'Connor) (Yaroslav Romaniuk)

Video recording of the interview broadcast:

